



REPORT

DE Karn Generating Facility
Bottom Ash Impoundment
2023 Annual Landfill Inspection Report
West Olive, Michigan

Pursuant to 40 CFR 257.84

Submitted to:

Consumers Energy Company

1945 W. Parnall Road
Jackson, Michigan 49201

Submitted by:

WSP Michigan Inc.

15851 South US 27, Suite 50, Lansing, Michigan, USA 48906

+1 517 482 2262

GL21465697.003

October 2023



Certification

Professional Engineer Certification Statement [40 CFR 257.84]

I hereby certify that, having reviewed the attached documentation and being familiar with the provisions of Title 40 of the Code of Federal Regulations Section 257.84 (40 CFR Part 257.84), I attest that this Annual Inspection Report is accurate and has been prepared in accordance with good engineering practices, including the consideration of applicable industry standards, and with the requirements of 40 CFR Part 257.84.

WSP Michigan Inc.



Signature

10/6/2023

Date of Report Certification

Samuel F. Stafford, PE

Name

6201308939

Professional Engineer Certification Number

Table of Contents

1.0 INTRODUCTION 4

2.0 BACKGROUND AND DOCUMENT REVIEW SUMMARY 4

3.0 2023 VISUAL INSPECTION 5

4.0 LIMITATIONS OF ASSESSMENT 7

5.0 CLOSING 7

Table 1: Summary of Background Document Review 5

APPENDICES

Appendix A – Visual Inspection Checklist

1.0 INTRODUCTION

On April 17, 2015, the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) issued the Coal Combustion Residual (CCR) Resource Conservation and Recovery Act (RCRA) Rule (40 CFR 257 Subpart D) (“CCR RCRA Rule”). The CCR RCRA Rule requires owners or operators of existing CCR surface impoundments to have those units inspected on an annual basis by a qualified professional engineer (QPE) in accordance with 40 CFR 257.83(b). The annual qualified professional engineer inspections are required to be completed and the results documented in inspection reports (per 40 CFR 257.83(b)(2) for Existing CCR Surface Impoundments. These inspections are focused primarily on the structural stability of the unit and must ensure that the operation and maintenance of the unit is in accordance with recognized and generally accepted good engineering standards. Each inspection must be conducted and certified by a QPE.

WSP Michigan Inc. (WSP) was retained by Consumers Energy Company (CEC) to perform the annual inspection of the Bottom Ash Impoundment at the D.E. Karn Generating Facility (D.E. Karn, Site) to document, to the extent reasonable based on the information provided by CEC and the limits of the visual inspection, that the design, construction, operation, and maintenance of the CCR unit is consistent with recognized and generally accepted good engineering standards. The Bottom Ash Impoundment was constructed in 2018 and was operational at the time of the inspection. The Site has ceased generating electricity and is being decommissioned.

The inspection included the following:

- Review of applicable information regarding the status and condition of the CCR unit
- A visual inspection of the CCR unit to identify signs of distress or malfunction of the CCR unit and appurtenant structures
- A visual inspection of hydraulic structures passing through the dike of the CCR unit for structural integrity and continued safe and reliable operation

2.0 BACKGROUND AND DOCUMENT REVIEW SUMMARY

Bottom ash was sluiced from the D.E. Karn Unit 1 & 2 electrical generating units to the Bottom Ash Impoundment. The Bottom Ash Pond is no longer operational and was closed by removal of CCR in 2019. An elevated trestle and pipe system hydraulically conveys bottom ash to the impoundment system through two 10-inch diameter Nuvaloy pipes each connected to 15-feet of flexible rubber hose at the inlet. Stored bottom ash is removed via mechanical equipment from the pond as required to maintain storage capacity. Water is discharged from the settling basin section of the impoundment through an 18-inch diameter SDR 11 HDPE pipe located on the east side into the polishing basin section of the impoundment. The water is then discharged from the polishing basin section through a 24-inch DR 17 HDPE pipe located near the southeast corner into an internal ditch that conveys the flow to the Site’s permitted National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) outfall.

The applicable available information reviewed for this assessment is summarized in Table 1 below.

Table 1: Summary of Background Document Review

Document	Date	Author
Weekly inspections performed by CEC	May 2022 – April 2023	Bottom Ash Pond Qualified Personnel
D.E. Karn Generating Facility Bottom Ash Impoundment 2022 Annual Surface Impoundment Inspection Report	October 2022	Golder Associates USA Inc.
D.E. Karn Generating Facility Bottom Ash Impoundment 2021 Annual Surface Impoundment Inspection Report	October 2021	Golder Associates Inc.
D.E. Karn Generating Facility Bottom Ash Impoundment 2020 Annual Surface Impoundment Inspection Report	October 2020	Golder Associates Inc.
D.E. Karn Generating Facility Bottom Ash Impoundment 2019 Annual Surface Impoundment Inspection Report	October 2019	Golder Associates Inc.
D.E. Karn Generating Facility Bottom Ash Impoundment 2018 Annual Surface Impoundment Inspection Report	October 2018	Golder Associates Inc.
D.E. Karn Generating Plant Bottom Ash Surface Impoundment Approved For Construction Drawings Revision D	February 2018	Golder Associates Inc.

3.0 2023 VISUAL INSPECTION

The 2023 onsite visual inspection of the Bottom Ash Impoundment was performed by WSP on June 12, 2023. WSP’s inspectors, Samuel Stafford, PE and Stephen Thumma, PE, were accompanied by two CEC representatives, as follows:

- Mr. George McKenzie, PE, CEC System Engineering Department
- Mr. Harold Register, JR, PE, CEC Principal Engineer – Landfill Compliance

The inspection checklist form (see Appendix A) provides both observations and recommendations as a result of the visual inspection and the following information as stipulated in 40 CFR 257.83(b):

- Any changes in geometry of the impounding structure since the previous annual inspection.
 - No changes in geometry of the impounding structure were observed.
- Approximate minimum, maximum, and present depth and elevation of the impounded water and Coal Combustion Residuals (CCR) since the previous annual inspection.
 - Average top of embankment elevation: 600 feet NAVD88
 - Average impoundment bottom elevation: 591 feet NAVD88
 - Minimum water surface elevation: 595 feet NAVD88, 4-ft depth (based on information provided by CEC)
 - Maximum water surface elevation: 598 feet NAVD88, 7-ft depth (based on information provided by CEC)

- Present water surface elevation: 596.5 feet NAVD88, 5.5-ft depth (based on field observations)
- Any instrumentation in place designed to monitor the structural stability of the Bottom Ash Pond.
 - There is currently no instrumentation in place designed to monitor for the structural stability of the Bottom Ash Impoundment at D.E. Karn.
- Storage capacity of the impounding structure at the time of inspection.
 - The Bottom Ash Impoundment is designed for a maximum storage capacity of approximately 9,660 cubic yards including both basins of the impoundment.
 - Only the west half of the Settling Basin is used for bottom ash collection. A bottom ash berm was constructed to separate the Settling Basin where it begins to widen. The western part of the Settling Basin is cleaned out routinely, so the maximum storage capacity of the impoundment is never reached.
- Approximate volume of the impounded water and CCR at the time of inspection.
 - Current volume of impounded water and CCR combined is approximately 5,000 cubic yards (based on an estimated water elevation of 596.5 ft).
- Appearances of actual or potential structural weakness of the CCR unit, in addition to any existing conditions that are disrupting or have the potential to disrupt the operation and safety of the CCR unit and appurtenant structures.
 - None were observed during inspection.
- Any other change(s) which may have affected the stability or operation of the impounding structure since the previous annual inspection.
 - None were observed during inspection.

The checklist categorizes observed conditions of the impoundment or appurtenant structures as either acceptable, monitor/maintain, investigate, or repair, which are defined as follows:

- Acceptable: The condition was visually documented to be acceptable, requiring no action beyond periodic inspection in accordance with the SMP and typical maintenance.
- Monitor/Maintain: The condition was visually identified to exhibit the potential for or show existing degeneration that should either be monitored or maintained as detailed in the checklist.
 - Items identified in this category are not considered a deficiency or release as classified under 40 CFR 257.83(b)(5) requiring immediate action by CEC.
- Investigate: The limitations of the visual inspection did not allow for an opinion to be made on the condition of the item observed, and WSP recommends additional investigation to categorize the item.
- Repair: WSP recommends that items identified with a repair designation exhibited conditions that should initiate measures be taken to rectify the area of concern.
- No items identified for repair were considered a deficiency or release as classified under 40 CFR 257.83(b)(5) requiring immediate action by CEC.

Based on a review of previous inspection reports listed in Table 1 compared to conditions noted during the inspection, the following changes were observed:

- Equipment rutting was observed on the access road adjacent to stockpiled bottom ash;
- Accumulation of sediment in primary basin prior to cessation of electric generation at the facility; and
- Gravel from the Bottom Ash Impoundment crest road is migrating into the lined upstream slope.

4.0 LIMITATIONS OF ASSESSMENT

WSP has conducted the site inspection and prepared this report for the new Bottom Ash Impoundment at D.E. Karn. The factual data, assessment, interpretations, and recommendations provided herein are based on the results of field observations from site inspections performed by WSP and review of previous site inspection reports provided to WSP by CEC and pertain to the specific project as described in this report and are not applicable to any other project or site location.

WSP has prepared this report in a manner consistent with that level of care and skill ordinarily exercised by members of the engineering and science professions currently practicing under similar conditions and has characterized the site conditions within the limitations of the scope of services as defined by CEC and subject to the time limits and physical constraints applicable to this report. No other warranty, expressed or implied, is made. Any change of site conditions, purpose, development plans, or operation may alter the validity of this report. WSP cannot be responsible for use of this report, or portions thereof, unless WSP is requested to review and, if necessary, revise the report.

5.0 CLOSING

This report has been prepared in general accordance with normally accepted civil engineering practices to fulfill the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act (RCRA) reporting requirements in accordance with 40 CFR 257.83(b)(2). WSP has reviewed the available information on the Bottom Ash Impoundment at D.E. Karn and performed an onsite visual inspection. WSP's assessment is limited to the information provided by CEC and to the features that could be inspected visually in a safe manner. WSP cannot attest to the condition of subsurface or submerged structures.

WSP Michigan Inc.



Samuel F. Stafford, PE
Lead Consultant



Matthew J. Wachholz, PE
VP Geotechnical Consultant

SFS/MJW/eag

[https://golderassociates.sharepoint.com/sites/145646/project files/6 deliverables/2023/rcra reports/karn/2023_de karn_bottom ash impoundment_inspection report_oct2023.docx](https://golderassociates.sharepoint.com/sites/145646/project%20files/6%20deliverables/2023/rcra%20reports/karn/2023_de%20karn_bottom%20ash%20impoundment_inspection%20report_oct2023.docx)

APPENDIX A

Visual Inspection Checklist

CCR SURFACE IMPOUNDMENT VISUAL INSPECTION CHECKLIST

Facility Name: D.E. Karn Bottom Ash Impoundment

Owner: Consumers Energy Company (CEC)

Purpose of Facility: Detention and settlement of sluiced bottom ash.

County, State: Bay County, Michigan

Inspected By: Samuel Stafford and Stephen Thumma

Inspection Date: June 12, 2023

Weather: 65-degrees F and sunny, clear

ITEM					REMARKS
	Acceptable	Monitor/Maintain	Investigate	Repair	
1. General Conditions					
a. Year Minimum Water Elevation	NA				595.0 ft-amsl
b. Year Average Water Elevation	NA				59.5 ft-amsl
c. Year Maximum Water Elevation	NA				598.0 ft-amsl
d. Current water level	NA				596.5 ft-amsl
e. Current storage capacity	NA				9,660 cubic yards
f. Current volume of impounded water and CCR	NA				5,000 cubic yards
g. Alterations	NA				None observed.
h. Development of downstream plain	X				None observed.
i. Grass cover					NA - geosynthetic lined ponds.
j. Settlement/misalignment/cracks	X				None observed.
k. Sudden drops in water level?	X				None observed.
2. Inflow Structure					
a. Settlement	X				None observed.
b. Cracking	X				None observed.

ITEM	Acceptable	Monitor/Maintain	Investigate	Repair	REMARKS
c. Corrosion	X				None observed.
d. Obstacles in inlet	X				None observed.
e. Riprap/erosion control	X				None observed.
3. Outflow Structure					
a. Settlement	X				None observed.
b. Cracking	X				None observed.
c. Corrosion	X				None observed.
d. Obstacles in outlet	X				None observed.
e. Riprap/erosion control	X				None observed.
f. Seepage	X				None observed.
4. Upstream slope					
a. Erosion		X			Stone from the crest road is migrating into the lined pond areas, see note 1.
b. Rodent burrows	X				None observed.
c. Vegetation	X				None observed.
d. Cracks/settlement	X				None observed.
e. Riprap/other erosion protection	X				None observed.
f. Slide, Slough, Scarp	X				None observed.
5. Crest					
a. Soil condition	X				Road gravel is migrating into the liner areas of the pond, see note 1.
b. Comparable to width from previous inspection	X				
c. Vegetation					NA
d. Rodent burrows	X				None observed.
e. Exposed to heavy traffic	X				Equipment rutting observed adjacent to bottom ash stockpile, need note 1.

ITEM	Acceptable	Monitor/Maintain	Investigate	Repair	REMARKS
f. Damage from vehicles/machinery	X				
6. Downstream slope					
a. Erosion	X				None observed.
b. Vegetation	X				
c. Rodent burrows	X				None observed.
d. Slide, Slough, Scarp	X				None observed.
e. Drain conditions	X				
f. Seepage	X				None observed.
7. Toe					
a. Vegetation	X				
b. Rodent burrows	X				None observed.
c. Settlement	X				None observed.
d. Drainage conditions	X				
e. Seepage	X				None observed.

General Remarks:

- 1) Features observed and documented in this checklist were not considered a deficiency or release as classified under 40 CFR 257.84(b)(5) and required no immediate action beyond periodic inspection in accordance with the SMP and typical maintenance.



wsp.com